

Tushar Allotments Collaboration

April 29, 2008 – 9:00 am – 5 pm

9:00 am -- Beaver Public Library, 55 W Center Street, Beaver, UT
Lunch and afternoon in the field (Sulphurdale / Cove Fort area)

Meeting Notes

(items requiring follow-up are in red)

Attending:

Bob Campbell, USFS
Jim Catlin, Wild Utah Project
Rose Chilcoat, Great Old Broads for Wilderness
Steve Flinders, USFS
Diane Freeman, USFS
Wayne Hoskisson, Utah Chapter Sierra Club
John Keeler, Utah Farm Bureau
Terry Krasko, USFS
Mary O'Brien, Grand Canyon Trust
Neil Perry, UDWR
Doug Sorenson, USFS
Jason Torgerson – Acting Public Affairs Officer, Fishlake NF
Michele Straube, Facilitator

Draft Economics Guidelines Completed -- CONGRATULATIONS

Terry Krasko passed out a draft of the economics report called for in the Collaboration resolution agreement:

The Beaver Ranger District and Appellants agree to work with economists to develop guidelines for quantitative economics analysis of livestock grazing in Environmental Impact Statements (EIS) for grazing authorizations.

The report has been extensively discussed and reviewed – this is the 11th version of the draft. It has been reviewed by 3-4 university academics, Beaver office USFS staff, an USFS economist, USFS Region 6 and USFS SLC staff.

The draft report sets out a template for doing grazing economic analysis for future environmental impact statements (EIS). USFS Region 6 will be using it for future EIS, and hopes that other USFS regions will follow.

Collaboration comments on the draft economics report are due to Mary O'Brien by COB Friday May 9, and will become part of the "project record."



New Fishlake National Forest Supervisor

Allen Rowley will start as the new Fishlake NF Supervisor on May 25, 2008. He is currently on the Nez Perce NF in Idaho, before which he was Deputy Forest Supervisor for Lewis & Clark NF in Montana. Terry Krasko suggested that everyone give him a couple weeks to settle in before contacting him. The Collaboration will be one of issues to prep him on.

Update on AOP Meetings with Permittees

Doug Sorenson gave a summary of decisions reached at the AOP meetings with permittees.

Pine Creek -- March 5 AOP meeting

Fencing:

- Convert Wildcat electric fence to barbwire (vandalism issues)
- SulphurBeds / Cove Creek – convert electric to barbwire
- Reset cattle guard between Pine Creek and North Creek pastures
- New cattle guards on Forest boundary – entry north of power plant (at least 16 ft wide; drillers had done a lot of damage) -- follow up with mineral specialist re: cost? ENEL drillers – willing to fix it?
- BLM cows onto Forest – between Wildcat and Little North Creek – spend more time looking at fence and checking for cows – stop trespass
 - BLM permittee cutting fence?
 - Fence not maintained?
 - ATV drivers?
 - Mushroom pickers?
- New fence line to South Spring – new cattle guard
- Interstate fence

Need to look at fence maintenance obligations

- New ownership
- Redo assignments on BLM, USFS,-- Selena, Joe and Clark Bradshaw

Water – Dipping Vat / Sheep trough –

- HB 208 (May 6 effective date)
 - establishes livestock water right on BLM / USFS lands
 - Permittee is owner of undecided water
 - USFS does not have reserved water right
 - When change in ownership, previous owner has to sell or relinquish water right to new owner or forfeit the use of the water
- Regional office / state USFS – figuring out what can do with water rights
- USFS cannot obtain a water right for livestock use? Only permittee can -- USFS does not have right to develop the water?
- **Who has water right on Dipping Vat?** Richfield Div of Water Rights Ofc – Mary and Jim Catlin to follow up
- **Issue of protection of wetlands below Dipping Vat**



Schedule

- Rest Cove Creek for 2 years (burning and partial seeding last fall
 - MOB – what is the seed mix?
 - Steve Flinders -- Mix of native and non-natives, based on precipitation levels
 - map of burn and seeding? – Corey Norman
- 2 herds – one starts in Sulphurbeds Pasture, mid-season to Little North Creek
 - other – start Pine Creek (biggest capacity of any pasture on allotment), stay until last month of season, then move to Wildcat
- Pine Creek – early trespass issue – Indian Creek and Wildcat before “on” date
 - Cattle from BLM and private – may or may not be different permittees (Clark Bradshaw, Blake Smith, Sherm Bradshaw)
 - Spring ATVs leave gates open
 - How to change behavior? Joe, Selena and **who else?** -- extra time on fences to close gates
 - ATV designs? Cattle guard for ATVs – funding issue -- range betterment funds

Ten Mile – March 10 AOP meeting

Fencing

- North Boundary fence – 2 cattle guards – ATV use – needs most work
- Wyatt – gate being opened by permittee (gate in Little Park pasture boundary fence beyond cattle guard; cows coming from Price Cougar pasture) -- have Dustin work 2-3 days / week in Ten Mile Pasture / Little Park to control cattle – work with cattle from bottom to ridge lines -- camp at Little Park or ridge above -- go to water developments in pasture and take them up to top
 - **Chain or LOCK this gate ??** Doug talk to Wyatt about this
- Emphasis on fence between Little Park and Price Cougar
- Extend west end of fence Price Cougar / Ten Mile boundary fence
 - Re-route fence ?
 - Identify main area that cattle move from Price Cougar to Ten Mile
 - Wyatt and Dustin GPS where fences are or not? Mark on a map at least
 - MOB expressed frustration that permittee cannot be required to walk the fence and learn simple GPS documentaton
 - **Two of Mary's interns (Season Martin and Aaron David) will walk these fences with GPS this summer**
 - Between Price Cougar / Ten Mile boundary fence
 - Between Ten Mile and Cottonwood (including west end)

Water system

- Control livestock use at water source itself

Schedule

- Ten Mile Pasture to be rested this year
- Start in Upper and Lower City Creek pasture and then go to Price Cougar
- Will run 150 cattle – may not be able to go entire season without removing early
 - Time frame is a month shorter than in the past – based on reduced forage production capacity per pasture being used



Final AOPs will be available within week to 10 days – **Doug to share for both allotments**

- Will trigger timing of browse monitoring (June and September)
- Will trigger timing of utilization monitoring (June and September)

Beaver reintroduction

Most recent version of the MOU was turned into “legalese” by USFS grants and agreement person

- Included “boilerplate”
- Doug Messerly, regional supervisor for southern region, needs to sign off for UDWR
- Remaining issues:
 - UDWR does not have capacity to do flow monitoring
 - Should state be bound to restrict trapping?
 - Quantify water monitoring
- Need to get feedback from Doug and Teresa re: what they will support / last discussion with Yardleys re: assurances they need
 - Discussion with Doug and Teresa, Terry Krasko, Steve Flinders, Neil Perry / Sean Kelly re: sticking points – **Mary to set up two conference calls** – first with DWR/USFS re: protections for beaver; second with permittees for monitoring / assurance to permittees re: water flow
 - **Terry / Steve to send most recent version of MOU – Neil / Steve will make corrections**

Lew Pence from Idaho has worked for last 20 years with ranches to use beaver to restore streams. He will be in Utah to give a variety of 1-hour presentations (with slides) on this topic.

- Joe Yardley will be interested in hearing this
- June 16, Cedar City USFS office (Dixie NF), noon green bag
- June 16, Cedar City library, 7 pm
- June 17, Beaver Opera House, 7 pm
- June 17 – Lew Pence will go look at Pine Creek - meet at Beaver Ranger District at noon - **who from Collaboration wants to go?**
- June 18 ? – videotaped presentation in Escalante (Anasazi Museum State Park, 7 p.m.)
- **Mary will send a notice to the Beaver paper to let the public know about the presentation**
- Mary hopes USFS and BLM folks will attend – **send suggestions of specific individuals to invite to Mary**

2008 field season schedule

Doug Sorensen presented a consensus field schedule covering 7/7 – 7/17. The beginning and end dates are flexible, but the 7/10-7/12 dates and activities are fixed (Mindy Wheeler scheduling constraints). Mary will have two interns with her.

- Monday 7/7 – aspen exclosures (location: Betenson- Grindstone)
 - Grindstone Flat exclosure in 1930s, rebuilt in 1970s – burnt as part of Pole Creek fire
 - Betenson Flat exclosures – also part of Pole Creek fire
- Tuesday 7/8 – aspen regeneration – Pole Creek Fire (location: Wades Canyon)



- Wades Canyon – Doug has a multi-year set of photos – use ATVs or horses
- Wednesday 7/9 – aspen regeneration (location: Pole Creek Fire)
 - Effects of Pole Creek fire – aspen regeneration / exclosures
- Thursday 7/10 – trend studies – Ten Mile Allotment
- Friday 7/11 – trend studies – Ten Mile or Pine Creek Allotments
- Saturday 7/12 – trend studies – Pine Creek Allotment
- Monday 7/14 – Thursday 7/17 evaluate springs and aspen utilization (Ten Mile and/or Pine Creek Allotments)
- **Doug to check with Mark whether it is ok to take data in PDA, and will forward appropriate data format to Mindy Wheeler**

Remaining summer 2008 field dates depend on when cows enter and leave specific pastures.

- Forage utilization studies – Doug likes to read after cows leave unit
 - Tentative schedule / based on AOP
- Indian Creek Road closed – Jim Catlin
- Wildcat pasture – last pasture used in season
- July – could still put out utilization cages

Forest Service (MIMS) and Rapid stream riparian assessment (RSRA) processes

Methodologies to be used by Collaboration during summer 2008 field season:

- USFS approved protocols
- Alternative method (RSRA)
 - Objective, repeatable, feasible – question of science – can another person come in another time and get the same results
- Possibly do both methods in same location – USFS and RSRA
- Use portions of USFS protocols, but not all of it
- Adaptive management – standardized approach?

Jim Catlin gave an introduction to the RSRA methodology, which is not currently a USFS approved protocol. The presentation PowerPoint is available directly from Jim Catlin. Comments / answers to questions are summarized below:

- National Park Service thinking of making RSRA a standard protocol for their agency
- What management happened between 96-99 to improve creeks on the allotments?
- **BCI macroinvertebrates assessment protocol dropped from Fishlake NF plan – what's being used now? Terry / Doug**
 - Too costly – couldn't sustain it – lab work (samples could be collected by lower level people, but lab work required contracting out)
 - Jim Whelan may have answer
- Jim Catlin – says RSRA is lower cost method than MIMS to give essentially the same information
 - Measurable change over time
 - Reference sites – streams in good condition are required for RSRA / a challenge to find sites in reference condition in many areas
 - Individual scores (of components) can inform restoration, more than the “overall mean score”



- Scores are by reach

Two times have been scheduled for David Smuin and Jim Catlin to do an RSRA for Pine Creek and Ten Mile. [NOTE: Since the meeting, David and Jim have decided to do both RSRA's in one trip, currently scheduled for May 31 and June 1]

- **Permittees, John Keeler, USFS, appellants are all encouraged to attend**
- One reach in each allotment plus reference area(s) – and may use Cottonwood Allotment as reference area
 - **Need input from collaboration regarding an appropriate reference area**
 - Pine Creek – upper area with exclosure (1/8 of mile) ???
- Wayne Hoskisson – working on reference areas for seven habitat types in three forests

RSRA Compared to MIMS

- MIMS is descriptive, RSRA is management and evaluation tool
- MIMS is not related to goals or desired conditions or management changes – describes quality of something
- MIMS difficult to use in adaptive management process
- Maintain transects over time – resample every year is ideal; correlate with flow events
 - Does not require high repetitiveness in short duration – could go back in five years and would still be useful

RSRA compared to Jeff Petty's Level II riparian inventory

- Petty doesn't quantitatively score for different elements, but includes information on numerous riparian elements
- Petty is more detailed on dominant species identification, (geology, soils, – building profile / survey observations -- quantitative)
- Petty does it all faster – describes a creek from headwaters to mouth in 1-2 days
- Petty = general assessments, then determine whether need more intense (Level III) assessment
- Petty's approach requires more technical expertise; RSRA can be done objectively with less technical, but trained, people.

Jim Catlin – send full Mancos report to Terry Krasko, Bob Campbell

David Smuin – 5 hours to do RSRA on one stream reach 1000 meters long, including intensive data collection on a 200 meter transect within the 1 km reach.

Rick Hopson – regional hydrologist – Jim to speak with him

Collaboration budget

Michele Straube presented a proposed budget revision.

- Collaboration would like to try to build more face-to-face meetings back in, if additional money can be found
- USFS budget has no \$\$ available
- UT Farm Bureau -- \$1,000 – not paid yet



- Jim Catlin – pledged some, possibly \$2,000
- Sierra Club – **Wayne to see if they have some \$\$** -- been turned down at least once already
- Can UT Farm Bureau and Jim Catlin's \$\$ be used as **matching grant? Mary will investigate** [Since meeting: see below]
- Also leverage contributed cost
- **Mary to check whether her grant is renewable** [Since meeting: The grant was a two-year grant; thus we can't go back to National Forest Foundation before April 2009]

Overview of Methodologies in the Field

The meeting moved to the field in a location near Cove Fort, and various methodologies were described and demonstrated.

- Utilization (Doug Sorensen)
- Nested frequency (Doug Sorensen)
- Riparian assessment (Jim Catlin / RSRA and Doug Sorensen / MIMS)
- Willow browse (Mary O'Brien)
- Springs – form, not methodology (Mary O'Brien)
- Fencing – general observations form, not methodology (Mary O'Brien)
- Aspen utilization (Bob Campbell and Mary O'Brien)
- Aspen stand structure (Mary O'Brien)

The person implementing each methodology this summer will provide the following information about the methodology by May 20:

- Objectives
- Method – how it measures what
- What can / will be learned using this method
- How what will be learned relates to the final report (existing or desired conditions, management practices)

This information will be distributed to all Collaboration members, and will be posted on the Collaboration website.



Tushar Allotments Collaboration

April 29, 2008 – 9:00 am – 5 pm

9:00 am -- Beaver Public Library, 55 W Center Street, Beaver, UT
Lunch and afternoon in the field (Sulphurdale / Cove Fort area)

AGENDA

Meeting Objectives:

- Follow-up on progress made since last meeting
- Overview and confirm data gathering methods to be used during 2008 field season
- Confirm schedule for 2008 field season, to extent possible at this point

NOTE: The times noted are for the presentations. Time for Q/A will be provided after each presentation.

9:00	Meet at Beaver Public Library – ?? volunteer to take notes ??	
A.	Update on AOP Meetings with Permittees Pine Creek/Sulphurdale Allotment (15 min) Ten Mile Allotment (15 min)	Doug Sorensen
B.	Beaver reintroduction MOU (10 min)	Mary O'Brien
C.	2008 field season schedule (20 min) 7/8 – 7/18 planned activities Other field dates dependent on cows	Doug Sorensen
D.	Rapid stream riparian assessment process (20 min)	Jim Catlin
E.	Collaboration budget	Group discussion

Carpool to field location in Sulphurdale / Cove Fort area
Exact location to be selected based on conditions (30 min)

LUNCH in the field (bring your own lunch)



- | | | |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| F. | Utilization (30 min) | Doug Sorensen |
| G. | Nested frequency (15 min) | Doug Sorensen |
| H. | Riparian assessment (30 min) | Jim Catlin / Doug Sorensen |
| I. | Willow browse (15 min) | Mary O'Brien |
| J. | Springs (10 min) | Mary O'Brien |
| K. | Fencing (20 min) | Doug Sorensen |
| Move to aspen area (30 min) | | |
| L. | Aspen utilization (30 min) | Bob Campbell / Mary O'Brien |
| | Aspen stand structure (30 min) | Bob Campbell / Mary O'Brien |
| M. | Next steps | |
-

Invited Participants

Lee R Yardley Joe Yardley Selena Yardley Clark Bradshaw	Pine Creek/Sulphurbeds Permittees
Wyatt Barnson	Ten Mile Permittee
Terry A. Krasko	USFS / Fishlake NF
Allen Rowley	USFS / Fishlake NF
Diane Freeman	USFS / Fishlake NF
Bob Campbell	USFS / Fishlake NF
Steve Flinders	USFS / Fishlake NF
Doug Sorensen	USFS / Fishlake NF
Sean Kelly	UT DWR
John Keeler	UT Farm Bureau
John Carter	Western Watersheds Project
Jim Catlin	Wild Utah Project
Rose Chilcoat	Great Old Broads for Wilderness
Wayne Hoskisson	Sierra Club, UT Chapter
Mary O'Brien	Grand Canyon Trust
Terry Shepherd Unable to attend	Red Rock Forests
Donald Willden Unable to attend	Beaver County Commissioner Sportsman
Kevin Mueller	UT Environmental Congress

